

Alternative Approaches to Managing Conflict in the Use of Natural Resources

Jacqueline Ashby

Director of Research

International Center for Tropical Agriculture

Cali, Colombia

Objectives of this Workshop

- To facilitate a learning dialogue about institutional reform related to community-based natural resource management
- To promote awareness of key institutional issues in relation to the topic
- To generate information and learn about viable institutional solutions
- To enhance capacity

Objectives of this Plenary Session

- To provide an overview and synthesis of the discussion of the cases on conflict resolution during the preceding days of the workshop

Approach

- Framework for case analysis
- Reflections and insights of workshop participants
- Synthesis: Lessons learned

Framework Questions

- What are the important characteristics of natural resource management that affect conflict and cooperation?
- What role do community-based organizations have in NRM?
- What are the causes of conflict in community-based NRM?
- What catalyzes conflict resolution?
- What do the cases show are the main feature of the process of conflict resolution?
- What are critical success factors?

In Natural Resource Management, There Are:

- Multiple stakeholders with competing objectives for the same resource
- Temporal and spatial biophysical interdependencies
- Difficulties of observing long-term or off-site effects of NRM practices
- Resilience if positive feedback loops are maintained
- Resilience if diversity is maintained

This Implies That:

- Conflicts arise among stakeholders
- It is necessary to understand multiple on-site/off-site causal effects to solve problems
- An intervention will have effects at different scales.
- The individual resource user loses track of consequences of the use of a resource
- Information and information management to ensure timely response to emergent problems is critical
- Situation/site specific solutions are required for sustainability

Therefore, There Is a Need for:

- Collective action
- Involvement of stakeholders relevant to the on and off-site effects in developing solutions
- Consensus building about cause and effect, and solutions to problems
- Improving land literacy for collective monitoring
- Motivating for action, creating incentives in the short run
- Organizational capacity to manage collective action, solve conflicts and to adapt strategies for innovation to changing environments over relatively long periods of time
- A high rate of innovation

What Role Do Community-Based Organizations Have in NRM?

- Provide a basis for collective action
- Contribute to social capital formation, or the capacity to work together
- Define roles, functions, enforce rules, sanctions, rewards for compliance
- Organize fora for negotiation and consensus building
- Promote site-specific technical innovation

What Role Do Community Based Organizations Have in NRM? (cont.)

- Contribute to micro-policy making
- Manage stakeholder participation in NRM planning
- Conduct participatory impact monitoring
- Interface with external agencies for NRM
- Catalyze institutional redesign

Why Does Conflict Occur?

- Stakeholders with livelihood use for the resource are excluded from use and/or from decisions about use of the resource(s): e.g. traditional fishing in the Islas Galapagos
- Inequitable access to scarce or degrading resource(s)
- Unprecedented increase in rates of extraction: e.g. large scale mechanized farming by the Jellaba in northern Sudan

Why Does Conflict Occur? (cont.)

- Interventions at inappropriate scales: e.g. community scale efforts to control forest use which needed to be managed on a watershed scale in Indonesia
- The closing of agricultural frontiers
- Extraction by international or non-local economic interests
- Traditional ways of sharing resources undermined by governments

Why Does Conflict Occur? (cont.)

- Use of a natural resource for development and livelihood purposes is defined as inimical to its conservation: e.g. Coastal development in Bolinao; free-range animals in forest reserves in West Timor
- Lack of clarity about boundaries, access and use rights and responsibilities: e.g. settlements within designated conservation areas in Nusa Tenggara

Why Does Conflict Occur? (cont.)

- Cause and effect of resource degradation cannot be determined readily, changes in the status of a resource seems unpredictable and hard to manage to stakeholders, effects of mismanagement or benefits of better management not easy to detect

What Catalyzes Recognition of the Need for Conflict Resolution?

- Key stakeholders perceive they can only lose from the conflict (the opposite of a win-win situation)
- Perceptions of cause and effect (who is guilty and who is the victim) are transformed by new information: Stakeholder participation in information gathering and collective diagnosis of problems

What Catalyzes Recognition of the Need for Conflict Resolution? (cont.)

- Social capital, interpersonal trust, norms of cooperation and reciprocity
- External facilitation
- The perceived costs of conservation (vs. mining) of the resources go down

What Are Key Elements of the Process of Conflict Resolution?

- A comprehensive stakeholder analysis shows the full range of interests, and which ones have been ignored or excluded from decisions about management of the resource
- Accurate information about the causes and effects of different stakeholders' management of the resource is broadly disseminated (knowledge empowerment)

What Are Key Elements of the Process of Conflict Resolution? (cont.)

- Information is provided which clearly defines boundaries around the resource(s): e.g. maps
- New channels of communication open up among stakeholder groups
- Parity among stakeholder groups and the legitimacy of competing points of view accepted

What Are Key Elements of the Process of Conflict Resolution? (cont.)

- Stakeholder groups which are relatively poorly organized, poorly informed or politically weak are strengthened through training and organization
- A viable multi-stakeholder forum or coordinating mechanism is established for future consultation, negotiation, policy formulation and decision-making

What Are Key Elements of the Process of Conflict Resolution? (cont.)

- New technological, institutional or legal options are made available for management of the resource(s) which provide an acceptable way to combine making a livelihood and conservation
- Local decisions are legitimized by higher-level authorities
- Local organizations provide a basis for collective action

Critical Success Factors

- Timely and accurate information to all stakeholders
- Building social capital
- Technological change
- Organizing stakeholder participation in decision-making
- Devolution; legitimization of local decision-making by higher authority

Critical Success Factors (cont.)

- Joint public-private sector management; coproduction
- Participatory monitoring (?)
- Accountability (?)